(Review Article)

Check for updates

Global policy harmonization in creative commons licensing: A roadmap for balancing creator and user rights

Onoriode Reginald Aziza [1,*], Portia Oduro [2], Ngodoo Joy Sam-Bulya [3] and Ngozi Samuel Uzougbo [4]

[1] Independent Researcher, Lagos Nigeria.
[2] Energy Law Center, Paul M. Hebert Law Center, Louisiana State University, USA.
[3] Independent Researcher, Abuja, Nigeria.
[4] Independent Researcher; Columbus Ohio, USA.

Abstract

This paper examines the necessity for global policy harmonization in Creative Commons (CC) licensing to prevent legal exploitation and ensure equitable protection for both creators and users. It highlights the challenges posed by inconsistent copyright laws across different jurisdictions, which often lead to vulnerabilities and copyright trolling. Through a detailed analysis of various legal systems, this paper identifies key inconsistencies and proposes international policy standards that balance creator and user rights. A comprehensive roadmap is outlined, featuring phased goals, an implementation framework, and mechanisms for monitoring and evaluation. The paper concludes with recommendations for future research and a call to action for policymakers to collaborate internationally, aiming to create a cohesive and fair digital content-sharing ecosystem.

Keywords: Global policy harmonization; Creative Commons licensing; Copyright law; Legal exploitation; Policy advocacy

1   Introduction

Creative Commons (CC) licensing, established in 2001, has become a pivotal tool in the digital era, enabling creators to share their work with flexible terms (De Rosnay & Stalder, 2020). These licenses allow authors to specify which rights they reserve and which they waive, promoting a culture of sharing and collaboration. In the age of the internet, where digital content can be disseminated instantly across the globe, CC licenses provide a standardized and straightforward method for creators to communicate their permissions. This has vastly improved the accessibility and exchange of educational materials, cultural content, and research, fostering an environment where creativity and knowledge can flourish without the traditional barriers imposed by stringent copyright laws (Dobusch & Kapeller, 2018).

Despite the clear advantages of Creative Commons licensing, inconsistent copyright laws across different jurisdictions pose significant challenges. Each country's legal system has its own approach to copyright enforcement and the exceptions allowed under the law, leading to a fragmented global landscape (Morrison, 2018). These disparities create loopholes that can be exploited, a practice known as copyright trolling. Copyright trolls often take advantage of these inconsistencies by initiating baseless legal actions to extort settlements from creators and users. This undermines the intent of Creative Commons, leading to a restrictive environment that hampers creativity and collaborative efforts across borders (Savelyev, 2018).

---

* Corresponding author: Onoriode Reginald Aziza

This paper emphasizes the necessity of global policy harmonization in Creative Commons licensing to protect creators and users. By aligning copyright laws internationally, a more predictable and equitable framework can be established, reducing the potential for exploitation. Harmonized policies would help prevent copyright trolling, thus safeguarding the interests of creators who wish to share their works freely. Moreover, such alignment would enhance the usability and accessibility of digital content worldwide, supporting a more inclusive and collaborative global digital ecosystem.

Focusing on policy advocacy and international collaboration, this paper explores the current state of Creative Commons licensing across various legal systems. It identifies the inconsistencies that enable copyright trolling and proposes international policy standards to address these issues. The paper outlines a roadmap for policymakers to harmonize copyright regulations, emphasizing the need for stakeholder involvement and phased implementation. The goal is to provide a comprehensive guide for fostering international cooperation in digital content sharing.

2 Comparative Analysis of Legal Systems

2.1 Different Legal Systems

Creative Commons (CC) licensing provides a uniform way for creators to share their work with specified permissions globally. However, the effectiveness and implementation of these licenses can vary significantly depending on the legal framework of different countries. This variation stems from the inherent differences in national copyright laws and their interpretations (Miszczyński, 2021).

In the United States, copyright law includes a broad doctrine of "fair use," which permits the use of copyrighted material without permission under certain conditions, such as for commentary, criticism, news reporting, teaching, scholarship, or research. The fair use doctrine provides flexibility and has been instrumental in supporting a wide range of creative and educational activities. Creative Commons licenses in the U.S. are often interpreted within this context, providing a relatively robust environment for their implementation (Hobbs, 2019).

Conversely, in many European Union countries, copyright laws are more stringent. The EU's Copyright Directive harmonizes certain aspects of copyright law across member states but still allows for national variations. For example, the scope of exceptions and limitations can differ, impacting how CC licenses are applied. Some EU countries have broader educational exceptions, while others are more restrictive. This patchwork approach can create confusion and inconsistency in understanding and enforcing CC licenses (Rosati, 2021). In developing countries, the situation can be even more complex. Many of these nations have adopted copyright laws that closely mirror those of developed countries but often lack the resources for effective enforcement. This can lead to a disconnect between the law on paper and its practical application, further complicating the landscape for CC licensing (Pilichou, 2018).

2.2 Inconsistencies and Exploitation

The discrepancies in copyright laws across different jurisdictions create significant challenges for the consistent application of Creative Commons licenses. One major issue is the exploitation of these inconsistencies by copyright trolls. Copyright trolling involves the abuse of copyright laws to extract settlements from alleged infringers through aggressive litigation or the threat thereof (Berenger-Russell, 2024). For example, a copyright troll might take advantage of the stringent penalties in one jurisdiction to target users or creators with more lenient or ambiguous laws in another jurisdiction. This can result in creators facing legal actions in countries where they have little recourse or understanding of the legal landscape. The threat of costly and protracted litigation can coerce creators into settling claims, even if they believe their use falls under fair use or other exceptions (Pappalardo & Meese, 2019).

The lack of harmonization also leads to confusion and uncertainty among users and creators about what is permissible under a CC license. A creator in one country may assume their work is protected under a certain interpretation of a CC license, only to find that users in another country face legal challenges for utilizing the work in ways the creator intended to permit. This inconsistency undermines the purpose of Creative Commons licenses, which aim to provide clear and predictable guidelines for using and sharing creative works (Constantin).

3   Proposed International Policy Standards

3.1   Key Principles

The foundation of effective international policy standards for Creative Commons (CC) licensing lies in establishing fundamental principles that ensure a balanced approach to protecting both creator and user rights. These principles should focus on transparency, predictability, fairness, and accessibility.

Transparency is crucial as it builds trust in the licensing system. Policies must be clear and easily understandable, allowing creators and users to know exactly what is permitted under a CC license. This clarity helps in reducing misunderstandings and legal disputes.

Predictability ensures that creators and users can reliably anticipate the legal outcomes of their actions. This is vital for fostering an environment where digital content can be shared and used without fear of unexpected legal repercussions. Consistent application of CC licenses across different jurisdictions would contribute significantly to predictability.

Fairness is about balancing the rights of creators with those of users. Creators should feel secure that their works are protected from unauthorized exploitation, while users should be confident that they can use CC-licensed materials within the defined terms. Fairness also implies reasonable enforcement mechanisms that do not disproportionately penalize minor infractions.

Accessibility is the principle that underpins the entire concept of Creative Commons. Licensing policies should facilitate the widest possible access to cultural, educational, and informational resources. This principle supports the democratization of knowledge and creativity, which is a core goal of the CC movement.

3.2   Harmonization Strategies

To achieve these principles on a global scale, strategic alignment of national laws with international standards is necessary. Harmonization strategies can be implemented through a phased approach, beginning with the adoption of common minimum standards and moving towards more comprehensive integration. Initially, countries can agree on a set of baseline standards that align with the core principles of Creative Commons. These standards would include definitions of key terms (such as "non-commercial use"), standardized licensing terms, and agreed-upon exceptions and limitations. This initial step would create a common foundation upon which more detailed harmonization can be built.

Countries can enter into bilateral or multilateral agreements to recognize and enforce each other's CC licenses. These agreements would ensure that a work licensed under Creative Commons in one country is respected and protected in another. This approach would gradually expand the scope of harmonized standards through a network of interconnected agreements. International bodies such as the World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO) can play a pivotal role in facilitating global harmonization. By incorporating CC licensing principles into international treaties and conventions, WIPO can help ensure that countries adopt and implement these standards uniformly. This would also provide a platform for resolving disputes and addressing issues arising from implementing these standards.

Ultimately, countries will need to reform their national copyright laws to fully integrate the agreed-upon international standards. This involves revising existing laws to incorporate CC licensing terms, ensuring that they are consistent with international agreements. National reforms should also include provisions for educating the public and training legal professionals on the new standards to ensure smooth implementation and enforcement.

3.3   Stakeholder Involvement

Achieving effective and sustainable policy harmonization requires the active involvement of a diverse range of stakeholders, including governments, international organizations, and civil society. Governments have the primary responsibility for enacting and enforcing copyright laws. They must be committed to the harmonization process and willing to make the necessary legislative changes. Governments can facilitate stakeholder consultations to gather input and build consensus on proposed reforms. They also play a critical role in international negotiations and agreements that form the basis of harmonization efforts.

International organizations like WIPO, UNESCO, and the Creative Commons organization themselves are essential for coordinating harmonization efforts. These organizations can provide technical expertise, support capacity-building initiatives, and serve as platforms for dialogue among countries. They can also help monitor the implementation of international standards and assist in resolving cross-border disputes related to CC licensing.

Civil Society, including creators, educators, researchers, and users of CC-licensed materials, must be actively involved in the policy formulation process. Their insights and experiences are invaluable for understanding the practical implications of licensing policies and ensuring that they meet the needs of all stakeholders. Civil society organizations can advocate for fair and accessible licensing standards, conduct educational campaigns to raise awareness about Creative Commons, and support creators in navigating the licensing landscape (Latilo, Uzougbo, Ugwu, & Oduro, 2024a).

Establishing collaborative platforms where stakeholders can regularly meet and discuss issues related to CC licensing is crucial. These platforms can facilitate ongoing dialogue, share best practices, and address emerging challenges. By maintaining open lines of communication, stakeholders can adapt to changes in the digital environment and ensure that policies remain relevant and effective. Lastly. engaging the broader public is also important. Awareness campaigns and educational programs can help creators and users understand their rights and responsibilities under CC licenses. Public engagement ensures that the benefits of Creative Commons are widely known and that the community supports the harmonization efforts (Ekpe, 2022).

4 Roadmap for Global Policy Harmonization

4.1 Phased Approach

Achieving global policy harmonization in CC licensing requires a phased approach, addressing short-term, medium-term, and long-term goals to ensure a systematic and sustainable implementation. In the short term, the primary focus should be raising awareness and building a solid foundation for harmonizing CC licensing. This can be achieved through extensive educational campaigns aimed at informing creators, users, legal professionals, and policymakers about the benefits and mechanisms of CC licensing (DiStefano et al., 2022). Additionally, countries should adopt a set of common minimum standards for CC licensing that are agreed upon through international consultation, clearly defining basic terms and conditions such as what constitutes non-commercial use. To further refine these standards, pilot projects should be implemented in a few willing countries to test their application in real-world scenarios, allowing for the identification of potential challenges and the development of effective solutions (Arntzen, Wilcox, Lee, Hadfield, & Rae, 2019).

In the medium term, efforts should focus on promoting broader adoption of CC licensing and establishing formal agreements among countries. This includes initiating bilateral and multilateral agreements that allow nations to mutually recognize and enforce each other's CC licenses, thereby gradually creating a cohesive network of harmonized standards (Rotta, Sell, dos Santos Pacheco, & Yigitcanlar, 2019). Additionally, national laws need to be reformed to incorporate the baseline standards established in the short term, which may require significant adjustments to existing copyright laws and the introduction of new regulations tailored to CC licensing. Furthermore, there is a crucial need for capacity building to strengthen the ability of legal institutions and professionals to effectively address CC licensing issues, achieved through specialized training programs and the allocation of appropriate resources (Alegría et al., 2021).

The long-term goals concentrate on achieving comprehensive global harmonization of CC licensing and fostering continuous improvement in the regulatory framework. This involves developing and adopting international treaties that formalize the harmonized standards, ensuring their consistent application across all signatory countries (Crews, 2020). Additionally, sustained public engagement and education are essential to adapt to evolving digital landscapes and maintain the relevance of CC licensing, empowering creators and users alike. Furthermore, establishing mechanisms for the regular review and updating of policies will be crucial in addressing new challenges and opportunities in digital content sharing, ensuring that the framework remains effective and responsive to the dynamic nature of the digital environment (Hannesschläger, 2020).

4.2 Implementation Framework

To effectively translate the goals of global policy harmonization into actionable steps, policymakers must establish a robust implementation framework that clearly outlines the practical measures required for adopting and enforcing new standards. This framework begins with essential legal and regulatory reforms, including drafting new legislation or amending existing laws to align with agreed international standards for Creative Commons (CC) licensing. Engaging in public consultation is crucial, allowing stakeholders—creators, users, and industry representatives—to provide feedback and ensure that the proposed laws meet community needs. Once the legislative framework is prepared, securing parliamentary approval becomes imperative to enact the necessary reforms, paving the way for a cohesive regulatory environment that supports CC licensing (Latilo, Uzougbo, Ugwu, & Oduro, 2024b).

In addition to legal reforms, institutional capacity building plays a vital role in the successful implementation of CC licensing standards. Policymakers should prioritize the development of comprehensive training programs for judges, lawyers, and law enforcement officials to familiarize them with the new CC licensing standards, ensuring effective interpretation and enforcement of the laws (El-Taliawi & Van Der Wal, 2019). Adequate resource allocation is essential to empower institutions tasked with implementing these standards. Moreover, international collaboration should be emphasized through the negotiation of formal agreements that facilitate mutual recognition and enforcement of CC licenses across borders. Participating in joint initiatives and forums will allow countries to share best practices and collectively address common challenges. Lastly, public awareness and education campaigns are necessary to educate creators and users about their rights and responsibilities under the new standards, supplemented by developing and distributing educational resources like guides and online courses to foster compliance and understanding (Kellner & Share, 2019).

4.3   Monitoring and Evaluation

Establishing robust monitoring and evaluation mechanisms is essential to ensure the effectiveness of implemented policies for Creative Commons (CC) licensing. One of the primary components of these mechanisms involves defining clear performance indicators. Compliance rates should be meticulously measured to assess how well creators and users adhere to the new CC licensing standards. Additionally, tracking the number and outcomes of legal disputes related to CC licensing will provide insights into the clarity and fairness of the new standards, allowing for adjustments as needed.

Incorporating feedback mechanisms is also crucial to gauge the practicality and effectiveness of the policies. Regular stakeholder surveys can be conducted among creators, users, and legal professionals to gather diverse opinions and insights regarding the new regulations. Organizing public forums and discussion groups will further facilitate open dialogue, enabling stakeholders to share their experiences and suggestions for improvement. To maintain the relevance and effectiveness of policies, a schedule for regular reviews should be established, ensuring that they evolve in response to changing digital and legal landscapes. International collaboration will enhance this process by allowing countries to conduct joint reviews and share findings, fostering a coordinated global approach to CC licensing. Finally, publishing annual reports detailing the progress of policy implementation—highlighting achievements, challenges, and areas for improvement—will ensure transparency and accountability. Additionally, implementing accountability measures will help address instances of non-compliance and ensure that institutions responsible for enforcing the new standards perform effectively (Ekpe, 2022).

5   Conclusion and Recommendations

5.1   Conclusion

In the digital age, Creative Commons (CC) licensing plays a pivotal role in facilitating the sharing and utilization of creative works. However, the effectiveness of CC licenses is often undermined by the inconsistent application of copyright laws across different jurisdictions. This fragmentation creates vulnerabilities that can be exploited by copyright trolls, leading to legal uncertainties for both creators and users. The need for harmonized global policies is clear. By establishing uniform standards and practices, we can protect creators' rights, prevent exploitation, and enhance the usability of CC-licensed materials worldwide.

The proposed roadmap for policy harmonization involves a phased approach that includes short-term, medium-term, and long-term goals. Initially, raising awareness and adopting baseline standards is crucial. This can be followed by forming bilateral and multilateral agreements and eventually integrating these standards into national legislation. Effective implementation requires a framework involving legal reforms, capacity building, international collaboration, and public education. Continuous monitoring and evaluation ensure that these policies remain effective and responsive to the evolving digital landscape.

5.2   Recommendations

While the proposed roadmap provides a solid foundation, further research is essential to address emerging challenges and refine policy approaches. One area for future exploration is the impact of technological advancements on CC licensing. As digital content creation and distribution evolve, new forms of media and innovative uses of existing works will present fresh challenges and opportunities. Research can help anticipate these changes and develop adaptive policies that maintain the relevance and effectiveness of CC licenses.

Additionally, understanding the socio-economic implications of harmonized policies on diverse creator communities is vital. Different regions and cultural contexts may have unique needs and priorities. Future research should investigate

how harmonized policies can be tailored to support local creative economies while ensuring global consistency. This includes studying the impact on marginalized communities and small-scale creators who might be disproportionately affected by policy changes.

Another promising direction is the integration of blockchain technology for tracking and enforcing CC licenses. Blockchain can provide a transparent and immutable record of licensed works, making verifying compliance and resolving disputes easier. Exploring the feasibility and implementation of blockchain-based solutions could significantly enhance the enforcement of CC licenses and reduce instances of copyright trolling.

5.3   Call to Action

To realize the vision of a harmonized global framework for Creative Commons licensing, policymakers must take proactive steps to collaborate internationally. Governments, international organizations, and civil society need to engage in sustained dialogue and cooperative efforts. This collaboration should focus on aligning national laws with international standards, sharing best practices, and addressing common challenges.

Policymakers are urged to prioritize the adoption of common minimum standards as a starting point for harmonization. They should also commit to ongoing public education campaigns to ensure widespread understanding and acceptance of CC licenses. By investing in capacity building and resource allocation, governments can support the institutions responsible for implementing and enforcing these standards.

International organizations such as the World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO) and UNESCO are crucial in facilitating these efforts. They can provide platforms for negotiation, technical assistance, and dispute resolution. Civil society organizations, including those representing creators and users, should actively participate in the policy formulation process to ensure that diverse perspectives are considered.

Compliance with ethical standards

Disclosure of conflict of interest

No conflict of interest to be disclosed.

References

[1]   Alegría, M., Frank, R. G., Hansen, H. B., Sharfstein, J. M., Shim, R. S., & Tierney, M. (2021). Transforming Mental Health And Addiction Services: Commentary describes steps to improve outcomes for people with mental illness and addiction in the United States. *Health Affairs, 40*(2), 226-234.

[2]   Arntzen, S., Wilcox, Z., Lee, N., Hadfield, C., & Rae, J. (2019). Testing innovation in the real world. *London: Nesta*.

[3]   Berenger-Russell, D. (2024). The Water Under the Bridge is Darkening—An Analysis of Copyright Law and the Prevelance of Copyright Trolls. *New Mexico Law Review, 54*(1), 297.

[4]   Constantin, L. 3D printing: From addressing the EU legal shortcomings to tackling the CC license attribution.

[5]   Crews, K. D. (2020). *Copyright law for librarians and educators: Creative strategies and practical solutions*: American Library Association.

[6]   De Rosnay, M. D., & Stalder, F. (2020). Digital commons. *Internet Policy Review, 9*(4), 15 p.

[7]   DiStefano, M. T., Goehringer, S., Babb, L., Alkuraya, F. S., Amberger, J., Amin, M., . . . Birney, E. (2022). The gene curation coalition: a global effort to harmonize gene–disease evidence resources. *Genetics in Medicine, 24*(8), 1732-1742.

[8]   Dobusch, L., & Kapeller, J. (2018). Open strategy-making with crowds and communities: Comparing Wikimedia and Creative Commons. *Long range planning, 51*(4), 561-579.

[9]   Ekpe, D. M. (2022). Copyright Trolling in Use of Creative Commons Licenses. *Am. U. Intell. Prop. Brief, 14*, 1.

[10] El-Taliawi, O. G., & Van Der Wal, Z. (2019). Developing administrative capacity: an agenda for research and practice. *Policy Design and Practice, 2*(3), 243-257.

[11] Hannesschläger, V. (2020). Common Creativity International: CC-licensing and Other Options for TEI-based Digital Editions in an International Context. *Journal of the Text Encoding Initiative*(11).

[12]   Hobbs, R. (2019). Copyright and Fair Use. *The International Encyclopedia of Media Literacy*, 1-16.

[13]   Kellner, D., & Share, J. (2019). *The critical media literacy guide: Engaging media and transforming education* (Vol. 2): Brill.

[14]   Latilo, A., Uzougbo, N. S., Ugwu, M. C., & Oduro, P. (2024a). Role and effectiveness of advance payment guarantees in construction contracts.

[15]   Latilo, A., Uzougbo, N. S., Ugwu, M. C., & Oduro, P. (2024b). Strategies for corporate compliance and litigation avoidance in multinational enterprises.

[16]   Miszczyński, M. (2021). Creative Commons Licensing and Relations of Production in the Sound Industry. *Polish Sociological Review, 215*(3), 353-368.

[17]   Morrison, C. (2018). Copyright and digital literacy: rules, risk and creativity.

[18]   Pappalardo, K., & Meese, J. (2019). In support of tolerated use: Rethinking harms, moral rights and remedies in Australian copyright law. *University of New South Wales Law Journal, The, 42*(3), 928-952.

[19]   Pilichou, A. (2018). Originality under EU Copyright Law.

[20]   Rosati, E. (2021). *The Routledge Handbook of EU Copyright Law*: Routledge.

[21]   Rotta, M. J. R., Sell, D., dos Santos Pacheco, R. C., & Yigitcanlar, T. (2019). Digital commons and citizen coproduction in smart cities: Assessment of Brazilian municipal e-government platforms. *Energies, 12*(14), 2813.

[22]   Savelyev, A. (2018). Copyright in the blockchain era: Promises and challenges. *Computer Law & Security Review, 34*(3), 550-561.